



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO FACULTY OF LAW

CIVIL APPEALS & JUDICIAL REVIEW

Analysis, Process and Strategy
in Civil Proceedings

Casebook

VOLUME I

JOHN A. CAMPION
ALAN L. W. D'SILVA
FASKEN CAMPBELL GODFREY
Toronto, Ontario
(416) 366-8381

Spring 1999

Prepared with the Assistance of
Jennifer F. Holland, Student-at-Law,
Fasken Campbell Godfrey 1998-1999

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN 21 1993

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

CIVIL APPEALS & JUDICIAL REVIEW

Analysis, Process and Strategy
in Civil Proceedings

Casebook

VOLUME I

JOHN A. CAMPION
ALAN L. W. D'SILVA
FASKEN CAMPBELL GODFREY
Toronto, Ontario
(416) 366-8381

Spring 1999

Prepared with the Assistance of
Jennifer F. Holland, Student-at-Law,
Fasken Campbell Godfrey 1998-1999



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/civilappealsjudi01camp_1

CIVIL APPEALS AND JUDICIAL REVIEW

CASEBOOK – VOLUME I TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART I – APPELLATE POWERS AND PROCEDURE

CHAPTER 1 – Introduction/Nature of an Appeal	<u>Tab No.</u>
Sopinka, J and Gelowitz, M.A. “ <i>The Conduct of an Appeal</i> ” pp. 3-5	1
<i>Canadian Express Ltd. v. Blair</i> (1991), 6 O.R. (3d) 212 (Div. Ct.)	2
CHAPTER 2 - Final and Interlocutory Orders	
Parties to the Proceeding	
<i>A. Merritt, “Final and Interlocutory Orders: An Analysis Of the Present Law in Ontario”</i> (1983), 4 Advocates Quarterly 484-499.	3
<i>Hendrickson v. Kallio</i> , [1932] O.R. 675, [1932] 4 D.L.R. 580 (C.A.).	4
<i>Re Buck Bros. Limited et al. and Frontenac Builders Limited et al.</i> (1994), 19 O.R. (3d) 97 (C.A.)	5
Non-Parties	
<i>Guaranty Trust Co. v. Fleming & Talbot</i> , [1946] O.R. 817 (C.A.)	6
<i>Smerchanski v. Lewis</i> (1980), 30 O.R. (2d) 370 (C.A.)	7
CHAPTER 3 – Stay of Order Pending Appeal	
<i>International Corona Resources Ltd. v. Lac Minerals Ltd.</i> (1986), 21 C.P.C. (2d) 252 (Ont. C.A.)	8
<i>International Corona Resources Ltd. v. Lac Minerals Ltd.</i> (1987), 21 C.P.C. (2d) 256 (Ont. C.A.)	
<i>RJR-Macdonald Inc. v. Attorney-General of Canada</i> (1994), 111 D.L.R. (4 th) 385 (S.C.C.)	9

CHAPTER 4 – Question of Law; Question of Fact; Mixed Law and Fact

<i>CNR v. Bell Telephone</i> (1939), 3 D.L.R. 8 (S.C.C.).	10
<i>Re Schiller and Board of Governors of Scarborough General Hospital</i> (1975), 9 O.R. (2d) 648 (C.A.).	11
<i>Wade v. Canadian National Railway Co.</i> (1977), 80 D.L.R. (3d) 214 (S.C.C.).	12
<i>Ter Neuzen v. Korn</i> (1995), 127 D.L.R. (4 th) 577 (S.C.C.)	13

CHAPTER 5 – Scope of Review

<i>Sopinka, J. and Gelowitz, M.A. "The Conduct of an Appeal",</i> pp. 40-46	14
<i>Stein v. The "Kathy K"</i> (1976), 62 D.L.R. (3d) 1(S.C.C.)	15
<i>R.D. Gibbens "Appellate Review of Findings of Fact",</i> (1992), 13 Advocates Quarterly, pp. 445-452.	16
<i>Lewis v. Todd et al.</i> (1980), 115 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.).	17
<i>Fletcher et al. v. Manitoba Public Insurance Co.</i> (1990), 74 D.L.R. (4 th) 636 (S.C.C.).	18
Sopinka, J, "Appellate Advocacy", The Advocate, March 1992 pp. 16-20	19

CHAPTER 6 – Scope of Review of a Discretionary Order

<i>Marleen Investments Ltd. v. McBride</i> (1979), 23 O.R. (2d) 125, 13 C.P.C. 221 (H.C.J.).	20
<i>Stoicevski v. Casement</i> (1983), 43 O.R. (2d) 436, 43 C.P.C. 178 (C.A.).	21

CHAPTER 7 – Setting Aside Jury Verdicts

<i>Graham v. Hodgkinson</i> (1983), 40 O.R. (2d) 697 (C.A.), leave to Appeal to Supreme Court of Canada refused, 51 N.R. 398.	22
<i>Farrugia v. Springer</i> (1992), 9 C.P.C. (3d) 55 (Ont. C.A.).	23
<i>Anderson v. Maple Ridge</i> (District) (1992), 10 C.P.C. (3d) 258	24

(B.C.C.A.), leave to appeal to Supreme Court of Canada refused (1993). 74 B.C.L.R. (2d) xxx (note)

CHAPTER 8 – Raising New Evidence and Issues on Appeal

New Evidence

<i>Varette v. Sainsbury</i> (1928), 1 D.L.R. 273 (S.C.C.)	25
<i>R v. Stolar</i> , [1988] 1 S.C.R. 480	26
<i>Mercer v. Sijan</i> (1976), 1 C.P.C. 281, 14 O.R. (2d) 12 (C.A.)	27
<i>Becker Milk Co. Ltd. v. Consumers' Gas Co.</i> (1974), 2 O.R. (2d) 554 (C.A.)	28
<i>Sengmueller v. Sengmueller</i> (1974), 17 O.R. (3d) 208, 25 C.P.C. (3d) 61 (C.A.)	29

New Issues

<i>Shaver Hospital for Chest Diseases v. Slesar</i> (1980), 27 O.R. (2d) 383n, 106 D.L.R. (3d) 377n (referring for further consideration C.A., Ontario) (1979), 27 O.R. (2d) 383, 15 C.P.C. 97.(C.A.)	30
---	----

Constitutional/Charter Issues

<i>Northern Telecom Ltd. v. Communications Workers of Canada</i> (1979), 98 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.)	31
<i>MacKay v. Manitoba et al</i> (1989), 61 D.L.R. (4th) 385 (S.C.C.)	32
<i>R. v. Seo</i> (1986), 54 O.R. (2d) (C.A.)	33
<i>Christian Horizons v. Ontario Human Rights Commission</i> (1993), 14 O.R. (3d) 374, 64 O.A. C. 395 (Div. Ct.)	34
<i>Black v. Law Society of Alberta</i> , [1985] 5 W.W.R. 284 (Alta. C.A.)	35

CHAPTER 9 – Conduct of the Trial Judge

<i>Philips v. Ford Motor Co. of Canada Ltd.</i> , [1971] 2 O.R. 637, 18 D.L.R. (3d) 641 (C.A.)	36
<i>J.M.W. Recycling Inc. Attorney-General of Canada</i> (1982), 35 O.R. (2d) 355, 133 D.L.R. (3d) 363 (C.A.)	37

R. v. Gaudet (1998), 40 O.R. (3d) 1 (C.A.) 38

Sorger v. Bank of Nova Scotia et al (1998), 39 O.R. (3d) 1 (C.A.) 39

CHAPTER 10 – Costs and Awards – Reviewing Assessment of Damages

Walker v. CFTO Ltd. (1987), 59 O.R. (2d) 104, 37 D.L.R. (4th) 224 (C.A.) 40

Hill v. Church of Scientology of Toronto (1995), 126 D.L.R. (4th) 129 (S.C.C.) 41

